

REVISED

This is a revised copy of the presentation that was shared in the 01.25.2025 Reconstituted Charter Revision Committee. During that meeting it was communicated by the Bonnet Shores Beach Club Committee Representative that there were 1847 BSBC eligible voters rather than the 2007 previously communicated. This presentation has been revised to reflect that new information.

BSFD Voter Affiliation and Scenario Data Analysis

JANE DURAN

JANUARY 2025

Approach

Data can be evaluated through many different lenses

The approach in this analysis was to evaluate the potential dilution and the impacts of disenfranchising various voter affiliations.

A person could have multiple affiliations with our community but can only vote once. Therefore, the removal of one affiliation does not mean that voter is removed.

- Four Data Sources Used:
 - 1) Aug '24 Certified BSFD Property Tax List
 - 2) Aug '24 Certified Narragansett Voter Registration List
 - 3) Aug '24 Election Voter Registrations
 - 4) Dec '24 Town of Narragansett BSFD Rental Registrations
- Cross referenced individual names with property ownership and Narragansett Voter list to come up with 7 different affiliation combinations. Identified unique voters across the affiliations.
- Cross referenced to the Aug '24 Election Registration Sheets

+ / - 10 % accuracy considering errors / incomplete source data

(ex: 160 Col John Gardner and 22 Namcook are listed as rentals + 14 addresses on the Narr Voter Reg List that have no record on the BSFD Tax Roll)

Directionally Correct

Fast Facts

Physical Property

(Taxpaying properties including land, homes, units):

- 1) 1076 BSFD Taxpaying Properties
 - 245 (20%) are Registered Full Time Rentals with the Town of Narragansett
 - ~ 400 (37%) are Seasonal Properties*
 - *Deed Types:*
 - 10 Corporations
 - 63 LLCs
 - 258 Trusts
 - 745 Persons
- 2) 930 BSBC Units per BSBC (Note: BSFD Tax Roll has 923)

2006 Total Physical Properties

Eligible Voters

Current State

- 1) 951 Narragansett Registered Voters
- 2) 1939 BSFD Property Owners (not inc. BSBC)
- 3) 1847 BSBC Unit Owners per BSBC (Note: BSFD Tax roll has ~1544)

Can't Total the above due to double counting

**7 Different Affiliation Combinations indicates
~3530 unique eligible voters****

*~400 Seasonal Properties estimated by comparing mailing addresses to BSFD property address. If different, categorized as potential seasonal, adjusted for known seasonal residents using BSFD address, subtracted the known rentals. Mailing addresses that were only reflected as PO Boxes in Narragansett, assumed not to be seasonal.

** Based on the 4 source documents

BSFD Current State | 7 Affiliation Combinations

AFFILIATION	NARR. REG. VOTER	BSFD PROPERTY OWNER (HOME/LAND OWNER)	BSBC OWNER
1) BSFD Narragansett Reg. Voters ONLY	✓		
2) BSFD Property Owners ONLY		✓	
3) BSFD Narragansett Reg Voters & Property Owners	✓	✓	
4) BSFD Narragansett Reg Voters & BSBC Owners	✓		✓
5) BSFD Property Owners & BSBC Owners		✓	✓
6) BSFD Narragansett Reg Voters, BSFD Property Owners and BSBC Owners	✓	✓	✓
7) BSBC ONLY			✓

Scenario 1 | Current State

Scenario ---->

Scenario 1: Current State As of the Aug 2024 Election: BSFD Narr Reg Voters, and all Taxpayers						
BSFD Voter Affiliation*	Total Eligible Voters		Actual Turnout Aug '24 (Original Registration Alignment)	Voter Turnout Eligible in Affiliation group	Turnout of Total Potential Voters in Election	% of Turnout of Total Turnout in Election
BSFD Narr Reg Voters Only	460	13%	46	10%	1%	6%
BSFD Property Owners Only	870	25%	122	14%	3%	16%
BSFD Narr Voters & BSFD Property Owners	353	10%	174	49%	5%	22%
BSFD Narr Reg Voter & BSBC Owners	16	0%	8	50%	0%	1%
BSFD Property Owner & BSBC Owner	222	6%	85	38%	2%	11%
BSFD Narr Reg Voter, BSFD and BSBC (all 3)	122	3%	92	75%	3%	12%
BSFD Sub Total	2043	58%	527	Total N/A	15%	68%
BSBC Only Affiliation Total (based on Tax Roll)	1171	42%	247	17%	7%	32%
BSBC Balance of remaining (to balance to 1847)	316					
Total BSBC Only Affiliation	1487	42%	247	Total N/A	7%	32%
Grand Total	3530	100%	774	Total N/A	22%	100%

Based on the August 2024 election, 22% of the 3560 potential voters turned out to vote (774 persons)

Observations:

- 1) BSFD affiliations have the majority in the current state
- 2) 460 net new voters were made eligible to vote due to consent order judgement. 46 turned out to vote (10%, representing 6% of total voter turnout)
- 3) Multiple affiliations with BSFD - **58% of the total current eligible population has an affiliation with BSFD other than being a BSBC owner.** Of this population 15% voted in the last election representing 68% of the registered voters (majority).
- 4) BSBC Only - 42% of the total current eligible population is only a BSBC owner. Of this population, 7% voted in the last election representing 32% of the registered voters (minority – no dilution from BSBC ONLY)
- 5) Potential litigation costs regarding the Constitutional alignment and Commercially zoned position held by some
- 6) Preserves +90 year relationship with BSBC

Scenario 2 | Only BSFD Narragansett Registered Voters

Scenario ---->

Scenario	Scenario 2: Only BSFD Narr Registered Voters				
	Total Eligible Voters	Apply Estimated Turnout for Affiliation Group based on Aug '24 Election	Estimated Turnout	Estimated Turnout % of Total Turnout	
BSFD Voter Affiliation*					
BSFD Narr Reg Voters Only	460	48%	10%	46	14%
BSFD Property Owners Only					
BSFD Narr Voters & BSFD Property Owners	353	37%	49%	174	54%
BSFD Narr Reg Voter & BSBC Owners	16	2%	50%	8	3%
BSFD Property Owner & BSBC Owner					
BSFD Narr Reg Voter, BSFD and BSBC (all 3)	122	13%	75%	92	29%
BSFD Sub Total	951	100%	Total N/A	320	100%
BSBC Only Affiliation Total (based on Tax Roll)					
BSBC Balance of remaining (to balance to 1847)					
Total BSBC Only Affiliation					
Grand Total	951	100%	Total N/A	320	34%

Observations:

1) Eliminates **73% (2579) of current eligible voters** (59% of the voters in the last election): **42%** would come from BSFD Affiliations and **58%** from BSBC Only Affiliation:

a) **1092 Voters from the current BSFD Affiliated Populations** (53% of Total eligible in the BSFD affiliation group and 27% of voters in the last election) representing BSFD Taxpayers with substantial interest:

- Seasonal properties (~400/37% of the 1076 properties)
- Rental properties (245/20% of the 1076 BSFD properties)

b) **1487 Of the 1847 Potential Total BSBC Voters (81% of the Total eligible and 7% of voters in the last election).**

2) Concentrates voting rights to a smaller population

3) Potential financial and quality of life implications with this scenario: Beach Maintenance, loss of Tax Revenue (annual and special assessments), potential litigation costs from disenfranchised constituents

4) Supports strong positions within the community that this is the only option citing Constitutional alignment for general municipalities that are governed by the board of elections (BSFD is not governed by the BOE).

Based on the August 2024 election, an estimated 34% of the 951 would turnout to vote (320 persons)

Scenario 3 | BSFD Narr Reg Voters, BSFD Property Owners, BSBC 1 voter per unit

Scenario ---->	Scenario 3: BSFD Narr Reg Voters, BSFD Taxpayers with BSBC 1 voter per unit				
	Total Eligible Voters		Apply Estimated Turnout for Affiliation Group based on Aug '24 Election	Estimated Turnout	Estimated Turnout % of Total Turnout
BSFD Voter Affiliation*					
BSFD Narr Reg Voters Only	460	17%	10%	46	7%
BSFD Property Owners Only	870	32%	14%	122	18%
BSFD Narr Voters & BSFD Property Owners	353	13%	49%	174	26%
BSFD Narr Reg Voter & BSBC Owners	16	1%	50%	8	1%
BSFD Property Owner & BSBC Owner	222	8%	38%	85	13%
BSFD Narr Reg Voter, BSFD and BSBC (all 3)	122	4%	75%	92	14%
BSFD Sub Total	2043	75%	Total N/A	527	79%
BSBC Only Affiliation Total (based on Tax Roll)	695	25%	21%	143	21%
BSBC Balance of remaining (to balance to 2007)	0				
Total BSBC Only Affiliation	695	25%	Total N/A	143	21%
Grand Total	2738	100%	Total N/A	670	24%

Observations:

- 1) BSFD would have the majority in this scenario
- 2) Provides 100% BSFD with substantial interest (home/land owners)
- 3) Eliminates 1077 voters (54%)
- 4) There are 695 BSBC units whose owners have no other affiliation with the BSFD which would represent 25% of the voting population in this scenario. Of that 691, 143 units voted in the last election representing 21% of the eligible units (minority – no dilution from BSBC).*
- 5) Preserves +90 year relationship with BSBC

Based on the August 2024 election, an estimated 24% of the 2738 would turnout to vote (670 persons)

*BSBC has 930 Total Units. 152 Units voted in August yielding 263 Votes. 691 of those units are aligned to the "BSBC ONLY" affiliation of which 143 units voted yielding 243 votes.

Scenario 4 | BSFD Narr Reg Voters, BSFD Property Owners, and No BSBC*

Scenario ---->	Scenario 4: BSFD Narr Reg Voters, BSFD Residential Property Owners (Taxpayers on Deed) and No BSBC				
	Total Eligible Voters		Apply Estimated Turnout for Affiliation Group based on Aug '24 Election	Estimated Turnout	Estimated Turnout % of Total Turnout
BSFD Voter Affiliation*					
BSFD Narr Reg Voters Only	460	23%	10%	46	9%
BSFD Property Owners Only	831	42%	14%	117	22%
BSFD Narr Voters & BSFD Property Owners	353	18%	49%	174	33%
BSFD Narr Reg Voter & BSBC Owners	16	1%	50%	8	2%
BSFD Property Owner & BSBC Owner	217	11%	38%	83	16%
BSFD Narr Reg Voter, BSFD and BSBC (all 3)	122	6%	75%	92	18%
BSFD Sub Total	1999	100%	Total N/A	520	100%
BSBC Only Affiliation Total (based on Tax Roll)					
BSBC Balance of remaining (to balance to 2007)					
Total BSBC Only Affiliation					
Grand Total	1999	100%	Total N/A	520	26%

Observations:

- 1) BSFD would have the majority in this scenario
- 2) Provides 100% BSFD with substantial interest (home/land owners)
- 3) Of the 1847 Potential Total BSBC Voters, this scenario eliminates **1487 (81% of the potential). Only 247 Voted in the last election 7%.**
- 4) Potential financial and quality of life implications with this scenario: Beach Maintenance etc.
- 5) Potential litigation from disenfranchised affiliation.

* In this option BSBC would continue to pay BSFD taxes

Based on the August 2024 election, an estimated 26% of the 1999 would turnout to vote (520 persons)

Tax Revenue Impacts if BSBC relieved of BSFD Tax Obligation

Tax Source - Current	Amounts	Percentage of Total Current Tax Base
BSFD Rental Tax Income	\$86,905.03	17.22%
BSFD Non-Rental Tax Income	\$356,353.71	70.60%
BSBC Tax Income	\$61,524.99	12.19%
Total	\$504,783.73	100.00%

BSFD Mill Rate = 0.00045393

****Run Rate of loss of BSBC Revenue considering a 4% increase YOY for 10 years

Year	% increase	Tax Revenue Lost	Cumulative Loss	Average per property increase each year to cover loss (assuming 1076 BSFD Taxable Properties/Parcels)	Average property Tax to be paid by each property	Total	% Increase each year for 1075 BSFD Properties	Cumulative % Increase YOY
0				\$0	\$412	\$442,857	0.0%	0.0%
1	0%	\$61,000	\$61,000	\$57	\$469	\$60,943	13.8%	13.8%
2	4%	\$63,440	\$124,440	\$59	\$528	\$63,381	12.6%	14.3%
3	4%	\$65,978	\$190,418	\$61	\$589	\$65,916	11.6%	14.9%
4	4%	\$68,617	\$259,034	\$64	\$653	\$68,553	10.8%	15.5%
5	4%	\$71,361	\$330,396	\$66	\$719	\$71,295	10.2%	16.1%
6	4%	\$74,216	\$404,612	\$69	\$788	\$74,147	9.6%	16.7%
7	4%	\$77,184	\$481,796	\$72	\$860	\$77,113	9.1%	17.4%
8	4%	\$80,272	\$562,068	\$75	\$934	\$80,197	8.7%	18.1%
9	4%	\$83,483	\$645,551	\$78	\$1,012	\$83,405	8.3%	18.8%
10	4%	\$86,822	\$732,373	\$81	\$1,093	\$86,741	8.0%	19.6%

Observations:

- 1) Year 1 The average increase per property owner will be \$57 to make up the \$61k Contribution of BSBC
- 2) Over the course of 10 years the "makeup contribution" of BSFD Taxpayers will be \$732k assuming a maximum mil rate increase of 4% YOY to cover BSFD expenses
- 3) Removes BSBC contribution to any future Tax Assessments needed for major occurrences to be funded by Taxpayers

BSBC Beach Votes by Unit – August 2024 Election

Total BSBC Units (930):

2 Deluxe Live-in Units
 4 Live-in Units
 285 Cabanas
 26 Double Bathhouses
 206 Mini-Double Bathhouses
 407 Bathhouses

Total Number of BSBC Voters by Unit

Counts by # Votes per unit - Realigned Registration		Votes
# Units with 1 Vote	72	72
# Units with 2 Votes	62	124
# Units with 3 Votes	10	30
# Units with 4 Votes	4	16
# Units with 5 Votes	4	20
# Units with 6 Votes	0	0
Total	152	262

Total Number of BSBC Voters by Unit with No other Affiliation with BSBC

Counts by # Votes per unit - Realigned Registration		Votes
# Units with 1 Vote	68	68
# Units with 2 Votes	60	120
# Units with 3 Votes	8	24
# Units with 4 Votes	4	16
# Units with 5 Votes	3	15
# Units with 6 Votes	0	0
Total	143	243

Scenario Summary

Element	Scenario 1 Current State	Scenario 2 Only Narr Reg Voters	Scenario 3 Narr Reg. Voters, BSFD Property Owners, BSBC 1 Voter per Unit	Scenario 4 Narr Registered Voters, BSFD Property Owners, No BSBC (Tax obligation Remains)
Voter Reduction	N/A	2579 Voters (73% of Current Population – 42% from BSFD, 58% from BSBC = 34% of voters in the last election	1077 Voters out of 2007 (25% of the current total eligible - 100% from BSBC and 15% of the voters in the last election	1634 Voters out of 2007 (100% from BSBC)
Dilution to BSFD affiliations from BSBC Only Affiliations	No Dilution using current available data – does not predict future	No Dilution using current available data – does not predict future	No Dilution using current available data – does not predict future	No Dilution using current available data
Financial Impacts (Tax and services) / Quality of Life impacts	N/A	BSFD could potentially need to fund: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Kelly Beach Seaweed Removal (~34k/month for Little Beach) Storm Restoration Equipment rental/access Access to special BSBC events (Fireworks, Philharmonic) could be lost +90 year relationship could deteriorate	TBD – Need to determine if BSBC would continue to provide the current services to the BSFD under this scenario.	BSFD could potentially need to fund: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Kelly Beach Seaweed Removal (~34k a month for little beach) Storm Restoration Equipment rental/access Access to special BSBC events (Fireworks, Philharmonic) could be lost +90 year relationship could deteriorate
Constitutional Argument*	Does not support the position of some community members. <i>Note: BSFD is not currently governed by the Board of Elections</i>	Supports the position of some community members <i>Note: BSFD is not currently governed by the Board of Elections</i>	Does not support the position of some community members . <i>Note: BSFD is not currently governed by the Board of Elections</i>	Does not support the position of some community members . <i>Note: BSFD is not currently governed by the Board of Elections</i>
Potential Litigation	Yes – Constitutional alignment and Commercially zoned position held by some	Yes – From Disenfranchised voters with substantial interest.	Yes – Constitutional alignment and Commercially zoned position held by some	Yes – Constitutional alignment position held by some
Examples of other RI Fire Districts that do not provide fire services using this	Misquamicut, Quonochontaug - Registered Voters and Non-Resident Taxpayers	TBD – still researching	Misquamicut, Quonochontaug - Registered Voters and Non-Resident Taxpayers	Misquamicut, Quonochontaug - Registered Voters and Non-Resident Taxpayers

*Judge Taft Carter did not rule our entire voting base was unconstitutional, she added Narr Registered Voters to the eligible population and did not disenfranchise taxpayers. See Consent Judgment May 2022 confirmed on August 2024 (C.A. No. WC2020-0130.

Thank you
